

REGIONAL BUSINESS INITIATIVE

Expanding Trade and Economic Cooperation among Jordan, Iraq and the West Bank

METAC Workshop 2 Report:

Budget Preparation Process Beirut, Lebanon, March 12-14, 2012

March 2012

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by SEGURA Partners LLC under the SEGIR Global Business, Trade and Investment II Indefinite Quantity Contract (IQC), Number EEM-I-00-07-00001-00 Task Order # 06

REGIONAL BUSINESS INITIATIVE

Expanding Trade and Economic Cooperation among Jordan, Iraq and the West Bank

METAC Workshop 2 Report:

Budget Preparation Process Beirut, Lebanon, March 12-14, 2012

March 2012

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by SEGURA Partners LLC under the SEGIR Global Business, Trade and Investment II Indefinite Quantity Contract (IQC), Number EEM-I-00-07-00001-00 Task Order # 06

DISCLAIMER

The views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

Table of Contents

EVEN	T SUMMARY	. 1
	Introduction	. 1
	Background: Seminar Topic and Objective	. 1
	Participants	. 2
	Proceedings	. 2
	Results	. 2
ANNE	XES	. 4
	Annex 1: Agenda	. 4
	Annex 2: List of Participants	. 5
	Annex 3: Evaluation Results	. 8
	Annex 4: Regional Business Initiative PMP Indicators for METAC Workshop 2	. 9

EVENT SUMMARY

Introduction

In October 2010, USAID launched the **Regional Business Initiative** (the "Project"), a one-year program consisting of a series of events held through September 2011, meant to gather businesses and government officials from Jordan, Iraq and the West Bank to discuss potential exchanges, and to help solve main obstacles to trade and joint business activities. The program is funded by USAID's Office of Middle East Programs and implemented by SEGURA Partners LLC.

Through a series of regional events (workshops and business exchanges), the project aims to bring together stakeholders from Jordan, the West Bank and Iraq to develop specific action plans to address constraints to increased regional trade, which can subsequently be used by USAID/Jordan, USAID/West Bank and Gaza and USAID/Iraq in their bilateral programming.

In September 2011, the contract governing the Project was amended to be extended until September 2012, and to incorporate additional activities including workshops to be held in collaboration with the Middle East Regional Technical Assistance Center (METAC), on public financial management matters.

The first of those workshops was held on January 29-31, 2012, at the Dead Sea, in Jordan, and focused on Tax Compliance Management. This report summarizes the second workshop, which took place on March 12-14, 2012, in Beirut, Lebanon, on the subject of Budget Preparation Process.

Background: Seminar Topic and Objective

Budget credibility remains an issue. Recent years have seen significant shortfalls against estimated budget revenues, necessitating a tightening of cash rationing. Overestimation of expenditures seriously undermines the credibility of the budget and particularly affects the level of capital spending. The objective of this seminar was to provide senior managers and budget officers in ministries of finance with a detailed understanding of how to prepare annual budgets in the context of their government's medium term fiscal policies and financial constraints.

The Beirut workshop focused on budget credibility in general, addressing key constraints of having realistic revenue forecasting assumptions, realism in the estimation of expenditures, and techniques that can be used to overcome these difficulties. It covered the role of economic and fiscal forecasting in macroeconomic management, including financial programming methods, and participants drew up possible action plans for their respective countries to improve budget credibility.

Participants

Eight countries belonging to METAC participated by sending representatives from their respective Ministries of Finance: Afghanistan, Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Lebanon (host country), Sudan, the West Bank, and Yemen.

Two guest countries from the region attended (at their own cost): Oman and Saudi Arabia. Morocco also sent two representatives, in response to a request from USAID/Morocco that Moroccan officials be invited to the workshop.

USAID was represented by Matta George, Senior Financial Specialist, USAID/Egypt.

A complete list of attendees is attached in Annex 2.

Proceedings

The workshop was led by a subject matter expert from METAC, Mr. Jacques Charaoui, and by IMF expert Mr. Richard Allen. Country specific presentations were made by representatives from Lebanon and Jordan. Each session was followed by questions and answers that allowed participants to give their feedback and ask for clarifications.

Mr. Charaoui summarized the events proceedings as follows:

"The global economic and financial crisis and the impact of fundamental transformation on the economic and financial situation of countries in the region have stretched public finance more than ever before, and oil and non-oil economies are now facing important, if not critical challenges. Most countries are now seeking to develop and implement measures and policies which will improve public sector efficiency and effectiveness. This workshop served as a platform for sharing countries' experience towards improving public sector efficiency and effectiveness, and for discussion of potential alternatives to overcome the obstacles of this new environment. The dynamic discussions and debates that characterized the sessions proved that this event was a great opportunity to share experiences, good practices and challenges in preparing credible budget taking into account these new constraints and obstacles."

The agenda is included in Annex 1.

Results

The questionnaire distributed by METAC indicates that this workshop was successful in the eyes of the participants. For instance, the question of whether the workshop improved the participants' understanding of the topic received an average rating of 4.3 out of 5, while whether the knowledge gained has value added for work on the topic received an average of 3.9. The overall satisfaction was rated at 4.4.

The results to the questionnaire are included in Annex 3.

The indicators to the Regional Business Initiative PMP are included in Annex 4.	

ANNEXES

Annex 1: Agenda

Workshop on Budget Preparation Process – Beirut, Lebanon March 12-14, 2012

Sessions	Day 1 – Monday March 12	Sessions	Day 2 – Tuesday March 13	Sessions	Day 3 – Wednesday March 14
09:00 – 10:30	Welcome Saade Chami (METAC) Alain Bifani (Director General of Finances – MoF Lebanon) Introduction Aims of workshop, program outline, participant suggestions/priorities & group photo – Jacques Charaoui (METAC)	09:00 – 10:30	Overview 2– Richard Allen (IMF): Developing basic tools of budgeting	09:00 – 10:30	Overview 3– Richard Allen (IMF): Developing a programmatic and performance-related budget structure – key prerequisites and challenges
10:30 - 11:00	Coffee Break	10:30 - 11:00	Coffee Break	10:30 - 11:00	Coffee Break
11:00 – 12:15	Overview 1 – Richard Allen (IMF): Overview of the budget preparation process – key issues in preparing a credible budget	11:00 – 12:15	Action plans for individual countries to improve budget credibility – Jacques Charaoui (METAC)	11:00 – 12:00	Dr. Khaled Amin – Guest Speaker (USAID) Budget preparation challenges in Egypt after the revolution
12:15 - 13:30	Lunch Break	12:15 - 13:30	Lunch Break	12:00 - 13:15	Lunch Break
13:30 - 14:00	Countries Experience: Lebanon	13:30 - 14:00	Countries Experience: West Bank and Gaza and Jordan	13:15 – 15:00	Open Forum Wrap-Up Participants' comments, workshop evaluation
		14:45 - 15:00	Coffee Break		
14:00 – 15:30	FMIS: WB Experience – Guest speaker: Cem Dener (WB) – VC session How FMIS projects performed according to various criteria? What are the key factors that contribute to the success and failure	15:00 – 17:00	MTEF: WB World Bank study of lessons of implementing MTEFs around the world - Guest Speaker: Jim Brumby (WB)- VC session Distinctions between "MTEF" - fiscal frameworks (MTFFs), budget frameworks (MTBFs) and performance frameworks linked to program/performance budgets (MTPFs)		

Annex 2: List of Participants

	Country	Name	Title	Department	Institution
1	Afghanistan	Mr. Abdul Basir Abbasi	Senior Fiscal Policy Analyst	Fiscal Policy Unit	Ministry of Finance
2	Afghanistan	Mr. Sayed Naseer Ahmad	Budget Policy and Reporting Specialist	General Budget Directorate/Finance	Ministry of Finance
3	Egypt	Mr. Nagy Abdel Fattah Elashkar	Under Secretary	Minister's Office Sector	Ministry of Finance
4	Egypt	Mr. Ahmed Mohamed Ahmed Abdalla	Director General	Budget Department	Ministry of Finance
5	Egypt	Mr. Khaled Zakaria Mohamed Amin Abou El- Zahab	Visiting Associate Professor	School of Globalization and Public Affairs	American University in Cairo (AUC)
6	EU	Mr. Francisco Lopez-Menchero	Attaché	Economic Development Cooperation Section	Delegation of the European Union to Lebanon
7	Iraq	Ms. Taif Sami Mohammed Al- Shakarchi	Director General	Budget Directorate/Budget Department	Ministry of Finance
8	Iraq	Ms. Afaf Muneer Abdulrazzaq	Director	Budget Directorate/Revenues Department	Ministry of Finance
9	Jordan	Mr. Nassir Essa Mohammad Ibraheem	Director	Directorate of Industrial Development & Investment Environment Enhancement Sector General Budget Department	Ministry of Finance
10	Jordan	Ms. Asema Michael Salem Doughan	Director	Public Treasury Directorate	Ministry of Finance
11	Lebanon	Mr. Alain Bifani	Director General		Ministry of Finance
12	Lebanon	Ms. Carole Abi Khalil	Acting Budget Director		Ministry of Finance
13	Lebanon	Ms. Lara Khalil Batlouni	Senior Economic Officer/Economic Unit	Office of the Minister/UNDP Project	Ministry of Finance
14	Lebanon	Mr. Kevork Hagop Baboyan	Senior Economic Officer/Economic Unit	Office of the Minister/UNDP Project	Ministry of Finance
15	Lebanon	Ms. Tamam Georges Samia	Accountant	Budget Department	Ministry of Finance
16	Lebanon	Ms. Mirine Melhem Jabbour	Accountant	Budget Department	Ministry of Finance
17	Lebanon	Ms. Kawthar Dara	Project Manager	Emergency Fiscal Reform Management Implementation Support (EFMIS)	Ministry of Finance

	Country	Name	Title	Department	Institution
18	Oman	Ms. Hamida Hamed Al Hashmi	Budget Analyst Budget of Service, Power and House	Directorate of General Budget	Ministry of Finance
19	Oman	Mr. Mohamed Ahmed Sulaiman	Budget Researcher	Budget & Contracts Department	Ministry of Finance
20	Oman	Mr. Aiman Mohamed Said Masan	Budget Analyst Budget of Education and Health	Budget & Contracts Department	Ministry of Finance
21	Morocco	Mr. Faiçal Akkor	Inspector Division Chief	Bilateral Financing Service Budget Department	Ministry of Economy and Finance
22	Morocco	Mr. Youssef Farhat	Deputy Director	Financing Service Budget Department	Ministry of Economy and Finance
23	Saudi Arabia	Mr. Mohammed Saleh Al-Daham	Deputy Minister	Budget & Organization Affairs Budget Department	Ministry of Finance
24	Saudi Arabia	Mr. Saleh Abdullah Aldebasi	Assistant Deputy Minister	Budget Department	Ministry of Finance
25	Saudi Arabia	Mr. Abdullah Al- Shahrani	Director General	Finance and Management Department	Department of Zakat and Income Tax
26	Saudi Arabia	Mr. Abdalkhaliq Al-Ghamdi	Manager	Finance Division Revenue and Accounting Department	Department of Zakat and Income Tax
27	Sudan	Mr. Elsham Abdalla Abdalla ElFaki	General Director	Budget Department	Ministry of Finance and National Economy
28	Sudan	Mr. Awatif Abdelrahim Mohamed Osman	Deputy General Director	Financial & Budget Department	Ministry of Finance and National Economy
29	West Bank	Mr. Qadri Faleh Mohamed Bsharat	Manager	Infrastructure Sector Budget Directorate	Ministry of Finance
30	West Bank	Mr. Farid Ahmad Abdul Ghannam	Director General	General Budget	Ministry of Finance
31	Yemen	Mr. Mohammed Hasan Mohamed Al-Sharafi	Vice-General Director of State Budget	Budget Sector General Budget Department	Ministry of Finance
32	Yemen	Mr. Shukri Mohammed Abdelmughni Al- Ashaari	Senior Researcher	Budget Sector Technical Department	Ministry of Finance
33	U.S. Treasury	Ms. Celeste Kubasta	Public Financial Management Advisor	Budget and Financial Accountability Office	U.S. Treasury – Ministry of Finance/Lebanon
34	USAID Egypt	Mr. Matta George Matta Boctor	Senior Financial Specialist	Financial Management Division/Non-Project Assistance Department	U.S. Agency for International Development in Egypt

	Country	Name	Title	Department	Institution
					Middle East
35	IMF/METAC	Mr. Saade Chami	Coordinator		Regional
33	IMITALIAC	Wiff. Saade Chaim	Coordinator		Technical
					Assistance Center
36	IMF/METAC	Mr. Richard Ian	Public Financial	Fiscal Affairs	International
30	IMITALIAC	Gordon Allen	Management Advisor	Department	Monetary Fund
					Middle East
37	IMF/METAC	Mr. Jacques	Public Financial		Regional
31	IMITALIAC	Charaoui	Management Advisor		Technical
					Assistance Center
		Mr. James A.		Public Sector	
38	World Bank	Brumby	Sector Manager	Governance	World Bank
		Drumby		Department	
			Senior Public Sector		
39	World Bank	Mr. Cem Dener	Management		World Bank
			Specialist		

Annex 3: Evaluation Results

METAC Workshop on Budget Preparation Process																											
Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012																											
2.1	P-2	P_3	P_4	P-5										P-14	P-15	P-16	P-17	P-18	P_10	P-20	P-21	P-22	P-23	P-24	P-25	P-26	Average
			•				+	+	1				1 10		1 10	1 10		1 10									4.2
\neg	\neg					Т	Т	\top	\neg																		4.3
4	5	4	4	4		4	5	4	5	4	5	4	5	5	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	3	3	4	4	4.2
4	4	3	5	5		5	5	4	5	5	5	4	4	5	5	4	4	4	5	4	5	4	3	3	4	4	4.3
\neg						Т	\top	\top																			4.3
5	3	4	4	- 5	3	3	5	5	5	4	5	4	5	5	5	4	4	5	3	4	4	3	4	3	5	4	4.2
5	4	4	4	5	4	4	5	4	5	5	5	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	3	3	4	4	5	5	4.5
						Т	\top	\top																			4.0
3		3	3	4	- 3	3	5	3	5	5	4	4	5	5	5		4	4	2	4	4	3	3	4	4	4	3.9
4	4	4	4	- 5	4	4	5	4	5	4	5	4	4	5	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	3	4	3	4	4.2
																											4.6
5	4	5	5	5	- 1	5	5	4	5	4	5	5	4	5	5	5	5		4	4	4	4	2	5	5	5	4.6
5	5	5	5	5		5	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	4	5	5	4	5	4	4.8
5	5	5	5	5	-	4	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	3	4	5	5	5	3	4.7
4	3	3	3	5	- 4	4	5	5	5	4				5	5	4	5	3	5	4	5	5	5	5	5	4	4.4
4	5	4	3		4	4	5	5	5	5				5	5	4	5		4	4	5	4		5	4	3	4.4
5	5	5	3	5	- 4	4	5	5	5	5	5	4		5	5	5	5	5	4	5	5	4	5	5	5	4	4.7
	5 5 5 5 4 4 4 5 5 5	1 P-2 4 5 4 4 5 3 5 4 3 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5		1 P-2 P-3 P-4 4 5 4 4 4 4 3 5 5 3 4 4 5 4 4 3 3 3 3 4 4 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 4 3 3 3 4 5 4 3	B P-3 P-4 P-5 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 3 5 5 5 4 4 4 5 5 4 4 4 5 5 4 4 4 5 5 5 5 5	Beir Pa -1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 4 3 5 5 5 5 4 4 4 4 5 3 3 3 3 4 4 5 5 4 4 4 4 5 5 4 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5	Beirut, Parti- 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P- 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 3 5 5 5 5 4 4 4 5 4 3 3 3 3 4 3 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5	Beirut, Lek Participa 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-1 4 5 4 4 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5	Beirut, Leban Participants 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 F 4 5 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 3 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 3 3 3 3 4 3 5 5 5 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 5 5	Beirut, Lebanon Participants' E 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 5 4 5 5 5 5	Beirut, Lebanon - Marticipants' Evalut -1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 3 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March Participants' Evaluation 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 3 4 4 4 5 3 5 5 5 5 4 5 5 3 3 3 3 4 3 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 4 4 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-1- Participants' Evaluation Sco 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 4 5 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 4 5 3 4 4 4 5 3 5 5 5 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 201 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 4 4 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 6 4 6 5 5 6 6 6 6	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 4 5 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 5 4 5 5 5 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 4 5 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 4 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 4 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 4 4 4 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 4 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 4 4 4 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 5 4 4 4 5 5 5 5 5 4 4 4 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 4 4 4 5 5 5 6 4 4 6 5 4 5 6 6 6 6	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 P-21 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 5 4 4 4 5 5 4 5 6 5 5 5 6 4 6 5 6 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 P-21 P-22 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 5 4 5 5 5 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 P-21 P-22 P-23 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 P-21 P-22 P-23 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 P-21 P-22 P-23 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 P-21 P-22 P-23 P-24 P-24 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25 P-25	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 P-21 P-22 P-23 P-24 P-25 4 5 4 4 4 4 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 5 4 4 5 5 5 5	Beirut, Lebanon - March 12-14, 2012 Participants' Evaluation Scores 1 P-2 P-3 P-4 P-5 P-6 P-7 P-8 P-9 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 P-21 P-22 P-23 P-24 P-25 P-26 P-10 P-11 P-12 P-13 P-14 P-15 P-16 P-17 P-18 P-19 P-20 P-21 P-22 P-23 P-24 P-25 P-26 P-26 P-27 P-28 P-26 P-27 P-28 P-26 P-27 P-28 P-26 P-28 P-26 P-28 P-26 P-28 P-28 P-28 P-28 P-28 P-28 P-28 P-28

Overall Average: 4.4

Fixed more focus on performance based budgeting and examples of countries. Wey long presentations through VC with no interactions. This would need to be improved. (FMIS presentations slightly technical and hard to follow for non-experts Need more focus on performance based budgeting and examples of countries who applied it. It would be interesting to compare budget data from participating countries. Confee break could be in a larger space.		Main Comments	
Good balance between slides and oral interventions by lecturers. Diverse speakers. Interesting country experiences on budget preparation. Would need more focus on the macro-economic framework for preparing a budget. Would need to have all handouts translated to Arabic. Would need more than 3 days.	Very practical workshop presenting current issues related to budget preparation. Very good workshop including principles and good practices to work on performance budgeting. Good interaction from participating countries with enough time for discussions. Good Topic, lecturers and organization. Excellent presentations delivered by Richard Allen with well written presentations. Excellent country presentation delivered by Dr. Khaled Amin. Good balance between slides and oral interventions by lecturers. Diverse speakers.	Weaknesses The workshop covers only theories, more emphasis on details would be needed. Need real examples on budget preparation and MTFF from developed countries and real case studies on how to move from traditional budgeting to program based budgeting including related set of actions and procedures, and how to practically develop a bottom-up MTEF. Vey long presentations through VC with no interactions. This would need to be improved. (FMIS presentations slightly technical and hard to follow for non-experts) Need more focus on performance based budgeting and examples of countries who applied it. Would need more focus on the macro-economic framework for preparing a budget. Would need to have all handouts translated to Arabic.	Round tables setup would be probably better for more interaction and communication . Additional topic to be added: GFSM 2001 + Unified budget system law It would be interesting to compare budget data from participating countries.

Annex 4: Regional Business Initiative PMP Indicators for METAC Workshop 2

	Indicator	Unit of Measure	METAC W	orkshop 2	METAC Wo	rents 1 and 2, rkshop 1 and 2)	Total Life- of Project
			Target	Actual	Target	Actual	Target
Eve	ents Execution						
1	Number of USG supported events held	Number of events	1	1	4	4	9
2	Number of positive evaluations of events / Average grade of the event (METAC) out of 100	% of total evaluations	80%	88%	80%	82%	80%
3	Funds leveraged by the Local Partner (AMCHAM/Jordan, METAC)	% of total event cost	50%	38%	30%	28%	30%
		Ev	ents Participa	tion			
4	Number of participants (disaggregated by sex, and by private sector/government)	Number of participants	40	39 (29m/10f 31 gov./8 donor-non gov.)	230	211 (169m/42f)	470
5	Number or ministries and government agencies involved	Number of institutions	10	12	26	29	68*
6	Number of sectors/subsectors involved in the events	Number of sectors/subsectors	N/A	N/A	10	10	25*
7	Number of companies participating in the events	Number of companies	N/A	N/A	55	92	75
8	Number of visits to the Web Portal	Number of visits	N/A	N/A	250	908	450
9	Number of B2B sessions	Number of B2B sessions	N/A	N/A	140	177	180
		Main	Outcomes of	Events			
10	Number of transactions identified or in progress as a result of the events	Number of transactions	N/A	N/A	15	14	20
13	Number of actionable programming recommendations for bilateral Missions	Number of recommendations	N/A	N/A	9	20	18

^{*} The same sector/government agency can be counted twice at different events.